

HUNGARIAN UNIVERSITY OF FINE ARTS DOCTORAL SCHOOL

THE USE OF SELF-REFLEXIVITY IN EVALUATION

New innovative visual education method

Developing visual self-assessment sheets

Assessment options for the *visual culture* subject
in secondary education

In the areas of self-evaluation, creativity development, reflexivity, tool
development, visual arts education

Theses of the DLA thesis

Zsuzsanna Paál 2023

Thesis supervisor

Dr Andrea Kárpáti

Dr Imre Nagy

The subject of the thesis

In my PhD thesis I am working on the development of visual self-assessment forms. It is about the construction, development and presentation of a new assessment method, with an emphasis on the importance of assessment in art education. The basis for writing this dissertation is the pedagogical background of the research I have conducted. The core of my work is a visual, pictorial, pictogram-like representation of the results of this research. These visual signs are emblematic pictogram-like condensations of self-evaluation sheets that represent complex concepts in pictorial form.

My master thesis presents visual representations of pictogram-like characters of visual self-assessment cards, based on pedagogical research, through the representation of movement sequences. My drawn characters are pictorial simplifications of a complex conceptual ability system on an A/4 scale. The visual self-assessment sheets I created based on my research were on topics that I have not seen prefigured in assessment-related publications.

The development of a system of visual self-assessment sheets is a novelty in the published research on drawing assessment. My dissertation is based on my fifteen years of teaching experience, my experimental teaching and pedagogical background. In the process, I created 120 hand-drawn pictogram humanoid characters. The resulting humanoid characters were created with an educational purpose, the primary role of which was the reduction of more complex text, and therefore I did not approach it from the perspective of illustration or cartoon character design. The educational aim is to help

students understand the condensation of figurative meaning in a way that can be understood and coded. To **create a traceable system that is** clearly recognisable. For a given topic, there is a question and 4 different levels of graphic answers.

Research objectives and research questions

1. Can self-evaluation develop visual creativity?

Self-assessment changes students' attitudes towards themselves and can develop visual creativity by changing their way of thinking.

2. How does regular assessment affect the development of pupils' visual skills?

I hypothesised that students' attention and creative awareness would increase through the regular use of self-assessment sheets, as the sheets would help them understand the developmental goals of the tasks. More conscious creative work can result in the development of visual skills.

3. Is it possible to reliably assess student performance by using symbolic visualisations of assessment?

I assumed that for the younger age group, a pictorial, visual form of assessment is more reliable than a text-only assessment.

4. Is visual assessment more effective than text-based assessment?

I assumed that evaluation criteria in pictures are more understandable and therefore more effective than evaluation in text only.

5. How do visual self-assessment forms facilitate development?

I hypothesised that the self-assessment sheets in the hands of the students when the task is given out would better focus their attention on the task and help them to give hints for better task performance.

6. What are the possibilities and limitations of visual self-assessment?

I assumed that a limiting factor could be that the cards display general evaluation criteria and are not fully adequate for the task.

Research work

As an alternative to assessment, I developed a self-reflection tool for secondary school students, designed to develop their sense of responsibility for their own studies. The primary aim of the research is to increase students' self-reflectivity, but it is also useful for teachers to get feedback on students' attitudes towards their own learning and on their problems and achievements in relation to the curriculum. The new form of feedback, which can be well integrated into the teaching process, provides an opportunity for both the student and the teacher to understand problems and move forward together. Visual self-evaluation sheets become a tool to support teaching and learning. They allow pupils to observe their own work in a more nuanced way, and thus to gain a better insight into the step-by-step nature of the learning process and their own school activities.

The new assessment method can be used to increase student efficiency in visual tasks. It can also be applied to other subjects and life situations through the development of student self-assessment. Teachers' assessment work can be enhanced with new opportunities to support their work.

The purpose of the self-assessment sheets I have developed can be split into two broad areas. One is to shift the perspective of the assessment to that of the learner. The learner himself marks the level he thinks he has reached in his own task performance. Looking back on his own work, he enters the field of evaluation in a self-reflective way. The second objective is to familiarise the pupils with the components of the task through the self-evaluation sheet. The creative work often consists of several steps, several details, but these are not always consciously separated for the pupils. The visual self-assessment sheet highlights the importance of the sub-tasks and the importance of the interdependence of the sub-assemblies.

Self-evaluation sheets are also important because they can change negative student prejudices about assessment. Picture self-assessment sheets can encourage students to think in new ways, which can lead to a more self-reflective attitude. The introduction of self-assessment sheets, in my opinion, develops a more sensitive, open-minded and self-development-oriented skill set.

The assessment sheet is an assessment method that can be used by both teacher and student. It teaches students the method of assessment while also developing their self-assessment.

In this study, I present seven types of visual self-assessment sheets. Each of these worksheets deals with topics that can be linked to a series of tasks that occur more frequently in visual culture classes. These tasks can be carried out individually or in groups, but they have in common that they project a longer creative process. In the case of tasks consisting of several stages, they make it easier for pupils to see the whole task, its structure and its construction. This can also be helpful for the teacher, because detailed explanations of the stages of the task are not always clear to the pupils. It is also possible to see from the task sheets the type of expectations they have for the task.

The worksheets are divided into 4-5 competences, with 4 different levels of solutions. The levels indicate how the student, in his/her own opinion, has solved the task. The levels are indicated by pictograms of my own graphics. Levels A, B, C, D are marked by the pupils themselves, according to their own feelings.

Level A means that you are not satisfied with your own work, Level B means that there are parts that you are satisfied with, but that there is room for improvement. Level C, in his opinion, did well on the task, but there is still room for improvement, Level D did well on the task, gained new insights and connections, and is satisfied with his work.

"The symbols on the page represent the activities in four positions, each expressing its quality of the activity. The levels of development of the visual ability system are based on the common European visual culture can be represented in a way that is comprehensible to

adults in the European visual culture. Prior knowledge of the assessment criteria does not reduce creativity, but increases fluency: sketches, alternatives. A detailed self-evaluation process motivates" (Kárpáti, 2019).

The table below shows the trial of the visual assessment forms: survey dates, locations and details of participants.

Experiment time	Content of the experiment	Educational level of participants	Age of participants	Experiment location	Number of participants
2023	fill in the self-assessment form	kindergarten	4-7 years	Székesfehérvár Seventh Week Toy Museum	N=26
2023	fill in the self-assessment form	kindergarten	4-7 years	ELTE-TÓK Practical Kindergarten	N=16
2023	filling in the self-assessment form	vocational secondary school pupils	15-16 years	Pécs High School of Art	N=30
2022	filling in the self-assessment form	high school students art education	15-16 years	Budapest Szent László High School	N=15
2020	fill in the self-assessment form	high school students	15-17 years	Reformed High School of Pécs	N=60
2020	filling in the self-assessment form	vocational secondary school pupils	16-17 years	Pécs High School of Art	N=60
2017-2019	filling in the self-assessment form	vocational high school students, OKJ training	19-21 years	Budapest Számalk Technical High School	N= 65
2023	analysis of the self-evaluation sheet, preparation of a thesis based on the self-evaluation sheets	Master's students	25-45 years	Budapest ELTE School of Teaching and Teacher Education	N=5
2020	completion and discussion of a self-evaluation form	Museum educators and visual culture teachers	25-50 years	Deák 17 Children and Youth Gallery	N=10
2019	filling in the self-assessment form	Part-time, teaching students	25-45 years	Budapest ELTE School of Teaching and Teacher Education	N=70

2019	analysis and discussion of the self-evaluation sheet	Mentor teachers Professional Assessment	28-50 years	Budapest Hungarian University of Fine Arts	N=10
2019	analysis and discussion of the self-evaluation sheet	Teacher training students	22-29 years	Budapest Hungarian University of Fine Arts	N=12
2019	filling in the self-assessment form	Teacher, researcher content developers	29-45 years	Budapest Institute for Educational Research and Development	N= 25

132 teachers, mentors, master's students and teacher trainees and 272 children and pupils who took part in the survey completed the self-evaluation forms.

Results of the research

Below is a brief summary of the answers to my research questions based on my research.

1. Can self-evaluation develop visual creativity?

Self-assessment can change the way students relate to themselves and develop visual creativity by changing their way of thinking. Conclusion drawn from the ELTE-TÓK teacher trainees' self-evaluation forms.

2. How does regular assessment affect the development of pupils' visual skills?

The students of the Pécs Art High School filled in the self-evaluation sheets several times, which led to the conclusion that the students' attention and creative awareness increased through the regular use of the self-evaluation sheets, as the sheets made the developmental goals of the tasks clear to them. The consequence of this more conscious creative work was the development of visual skills, which were assessed together with the drawing teacher on the basis of the pupils' portfolios.

3. Can student performance be reliably assessed using symbolic visualisations of student performance?

The research proved that even for the younger age group, the drawing and visualization format was more effective, as it worked in an experiment coordinated by practicing kindergarten teachers from ELTE-TÓK, when filling in the self-evaluation forms

4. Is visual assessment more effective than textual assessment?

In all cases, the discussions following the self-evaluation sheets showed that the assessment criteria in the pictures were more understandable and therefore more effective than the text-only assessment.

5. How do visual self-assessment forms facilitate development?

When the task is given out, the self-assessment sheets in the hands of the pupils will help with focusing their attention on the task and help them to give hints for better task performance.

6. What are the possibilities and limitations of visual self-assessment?

A limiting factor is that the cards display general assessment criteria and are not fully adequate for the task. An advantage, however, is that teacher colleagues receive much more feedback from pupils about their difficulties in the task if the teacher allows time for these to be discussed with the pupil when completing the assessment sheets. More detailed pupil feedback is available from the text explanations written on the back of the sheets.

Most important achievements of the research

Involvement of 3 educational and museum sites of the city in the research (Budapest, Pécs, Székesfehérvár)

4 publications in art education journals

8 participation in conferences, including one international conference at the European InSEA congress, Helsinki

7 visual self-evaluation sheets with the display of the diverse competences of art education
28 questions on visual education

120 drawn characters, drawings of the self-evaluation sheets condensing information, competences, creative phases

122 teachers, mentors, master students and teacher trainees involved in the research, whose supportive and reflective comments helped the research

272 children and students involved in the research, for whom the evaluation provided a new opportunity and helped them to think self-reflectively

Structure of the thesis

1. Foreword

Evaluation of the creative tasks in Visual Culture, Student self-evaluation, Background of the creation of visual self-evaluation sheets

2. Basis of research

Concept map, explanation of the context of a concept map

3. Visualisation

Visual turn, Visual signs and pictograms

4. Assessment and measurement using images

Figurative visual assessment cards

5. CORE of the THESIS

Level symbol system, Types of visual self-assessment cards, Format and graphic variations, Variability of pictograms for pictorial assessors

6. Assessment

Types of assessment, by functions, objectives, aspects. Assessment in visual education. Visual literacy framework

7. Visual self-assessment sheets in practice

Feedback from pupils, teachers and student teachers

8. Assessment sheet as a creative interface

Interpretability, narrative, colouring, levels

9. Relevance of visual self-assessment sheets

Conclusion

10. Bibliography

Publications and conference presentations related to the dissertation

2023

Conference:

VI Conference on Art Education VI MKE, MMA, Budapest VI MES, M.A.M.

Using drawing self-assessment sheets to question kindergarten children about their museum experiences

<https://mpk.elte.hu/>

http://mpk.elte.hu/download/reszletes_program_MPK_2023_v3.pdf

Publication:

Assessment of visual sub-competencies through Visual Rubrics: case studies based on the Common European Framework of Reference of Visual Competencies (CEFR-VC)

Andrea Kárpáti & Zsuzsanna Paál

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/1051144X.2022.2132618?needAccess=true>

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/1051144X.2022.2132618>

2021

Conference:

IV Conference on Art Education ELTE-TÓK, Budapest

Visual self-assessment sheets - play and self-reflection

[IV. Művészetpedagógiai Konferencia–Paál Zsuzsanna-Vizuális Önértékelő Lapok](#)

Arts Education Conference - ELTE Workshop for Arts Education 2021.

Conference subtitle: LIVE THE CULTURE - PLAY, ART EDUCATION AND SCIENCE - focus: play and children's culture page 173 Zsuzsanna Paál: Visual self-assessment sheets

<http://mpk.elte.hu/download/0708ABSZTRAKTKOTET2021MPK-EWAEv6.pdf>

Publication:

Zsuzsanna Paál: Visual self-reflection sheets

Self-reflection, presents the benefits of using self-reflection and demonstrates it through concrete examples.

Co-author: Styrna Katalin, Vizuális Kultúra 2021/4

<http://vizualiskulturaujsag.hu/lapszamok/>

<http://vizualiskulturaujsag.hu/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/5.%20Paa%CC%81l-Styrna.pdf>

2019

Conference:

Changes in pedagogy - changing pedagogy conference, Pázmány Péter Catholic University, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, Vitéz János Teacher Training Centre, Esztergom

Visual value forms in visual pedagogy

Paál Zsuzsanna-Vizuális értékelőlapok alkalmazása- PDF

III. Art Education Conference, Budapest

Visual assessment sheets, presentation of the research 2019 Art Education Conference
2019 Művészetpedagógiai konferencia

Pedagogical Evaluation Conference, Szeged

Evaluation in Art Education,

http://acta.bibl.u-szeged.hu/66222/1/pek_2019_053.pdf

2019 PÉK, Vizuális értékelőlapok, Paál Zsuzsanna

Publication:

Zsuzsanna Paál: New qualitative evaluation method in visual education, New Pedagogical Review, 2018/11-12

<https://folyoiratok.oh.gov.hu/szerzok/paal-zsuzsanna>

2018

Conference:

European InSEA congress Espoo (Finland)

Interdisciplinary visual art project

II. Art Education Conference, Budapest

2D Humanoid print, project presentation in visual education

2018 2D. Humanoid print Paál Zsuzsanna Konferencia

Publication:

Pedagogical Scenes, New Pedagogical Review, 2018/9-10

Zsuzsanna Paál: 2D Humanoid Print - pictures and description of a project

<https://folyoiratok.oh.gov.hu/szerzok/paal-zsuzsanna>

2017

Conference:

I. Art Education Conference, ELTE TTK, Budapest

Patterns, project presentation in visual education